Faith in forms: civil society evangelism and development in Tanzania

Maia Green, School of Social Sciences, University of Manchester

(maia.green@manchester.ac.uk)

Claire Mercer, Department of Geography and Environment, LSE

Simeon Mesaki, Department of Sociology, University of Dar es Salaam

Published in: ***Development in Practice*****, 22, 5-6, 721-734**

Introduction: religion and development in Tanzania

Interest in Faith-Based Organizations (FBOs) as development actors and partners has increased over the past ten years. This is partly based on a recognition of the continued importance of faith organisations in the global South (Deneulin & Rakodi 2011). The impact of post 9/11 politics is also significant (Clarke 2007). Development actors in the global north are concerned to retain influence in a context of global complexity and where political and religious concerns are increasingly entangled with development interventions. Despite policy interest from agencies like DFID and USAID in the potential role of FBOs in furthering development agendas, systematic evidence on their supposed advantages (and possible disadvantages) is lacking. Nor is it clear whether they have distinctive characteristics and approaches, with different (especially more pro-poor) outcomes, from secular civil society organizations.

Ongoing research and academic debate is considering these questions from a range of disciplinary perspectives (e. g Deneulin & Bano 2009; Clarke & Jennings 2007). Findings from such studies indicate enormous variation in the ways in which diverse religious affiliations impact on human development. They also point to the different ways in which what is categorised as the religious intersects with social and economic organisation in different settings. Consequently, it is not possible to assess the relation between what is religion and what is development in such contexts without imposing categories of analysis coming from the observer , creating an impression that there are similarities among what may in actuality be quite distinct cultural forms (see for example White 2009).

Recent policy initiatives to work through Faith Based Organisations as a variant of developmental Civil Society Organisations creates a situation in which it is possible to explore the difference between religious and secular actors in development practice. In Tanzania, a 'civil society sector' with roles in governance and development is a recent, largely externally-driven phenomenon superimposed on previously existing social and religious organizations. This study examined the position and role of religious organizations within a wider range of civil society organizations (CSOs) at the local level in two rural districts. Our concern was to assess the extent to which these organisations played a distinctive role in development in two contrasting districts; one relatively prosperous and largely Christian; the other largely Muslim and relatively poor.

In Tanzania there is a strongly articulated religious discourse associated with public service, development and voluntary participation (Schatzberg 2001). The majority of Tanzanians are adherents of major religious traditions. This means that there is no clear boundary between distinct 'faith' organizations and those with no explicit religious orientation. Religious affiliation is also significant in terms of political power and this is reflected in the civil society sector, which is predominantly associated with adherents of the majority Christian churches and the expanding or aspirational middle class (cf Hearn, 2001; Swidler and Watkins, 2009). Religious organizations, notably long established Christian churches, have retained an engagement in development activities through the continuation of service delivery functions established initially under colonial conditions of grants in aid and continued into the post independence period under the previous regime of contracted service provision (Jennings 2008, Mallya, 2010).

Outside state provision at primary and secondary level a significant number of formal education services are currently provided by Christian churches, generally through schools for which fees are payable. *Madrasas*, which provide Quranic education, often in addition to state secular education, are also widespread. The political exclusion and peripheralization of Islam (Bakari 2007, Becker, 2007, 2008) is reflected in the development of the civil society sector and donor support which has to date been predominantly aligned towards areas and organizations with connections to the mainstream Christian denominations which have been present in the country since the colonial period.

The Anglican, Roman Catholic, and Lutheran churches, for example, continue to be involved in a range of development activities, with local level projects in areas such as the environment or micro-enterprise, particularly for women, not unusual (Mercer, 2002). The faith sector is now changing. More recently introduced evangelical and Pentecostal churches are not only attracting ever rising numbers of adherents. They are fast becoming engaged in local service provision (Dilger 2007, Hasu 2006). Christian organizations are also becoming engaged in the emerging advocacy and policy influencing domains of what is constituted by government and donors alike as legitimate civil society activity.

A core finding from our research was the extent to which external factors, notably funding streams, impacted on the constitution and aspirations of the emerging political field in the politics of development in Tanzania. Neither faith based organisations nor civil society exist as naturally occurring categories. Both are brought into being through specific histories and constellations of actors and interests that are simultaneously local, national and international. In the two rural districts local FBOs and CSOs dominated the civil society sector, but a few international organizations were active, and local organizations are often connected to international organizations through complex funding and sub-contracting arrangements.

The paper is based on four months' research undertaken by a team comprising an anthropologist, a human geographer and a sociologist in 2009. Magu and Newala districts were chosen because they offer contrasts in terms of the primary religious affiliation of residents, the extent of their incorporation into the national civil society scene and the extent to which they are affected by problems of poverty. The two districts are arguably representative of the majority of places in rural Tanzania that have not benefitted in the long term from large-scale missionary activity. The district unit provided the best opportunity to look at the development work done by the key local development providers (the state, CSOs and FBOs) and the relations between them within a geographically manageable unit. We used qualitative research methods, employing interview and observation techniques with CSOs and FBOs, local residents, religious leaders, and local government officials. The research was informed by previous work carried out by the authors over the past fifteen years on Tanzanian civil society (Mercer 1999; 2003); religion and social change (Green & Mesaki 2005) and on contemporary Christianity (Green 2003; 2007).[1]

[1] In Magu District, interviews were conducted with 19 CSOs (including FBOs), 3 international NGOs, 9 government officials, and the following religious institutions (Church of Nazarene, Methodist Church, Calvary Assemblies of God Church, Roman Catholic Church, Faith Ministry, African Inland Church, Kingdom Hall of Jehovah's Witnesses, Salvation Army, Free Pentecostal Church of Tanzania, Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania, Seventh Day Adventist Church). In Newala District interviews were conducted with 18 CSOs (including FBOs), 1 international NGO, 11 government officials and the following religious institutions (Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania, BAKWATA, Anglican Church, Main Mosque Newala Town, Roman Catholic Church, Mosque Chiwhindi Village, Mosque Malatu Village). The following activities that were on-going during the fieldwork period were also observed: a condom distribution exercise by a CSO sub-contracted by UNICEF in Magu, and in Newala an anti-stigma village volunteer training workshop run by a local sub-contracted CSO and a village-based meeting to

The civil society sector in Tanzania

The civil society sector in Tanzania has emerged relatively recently in its current organizational form, largely as a response to the conjunction of political liberalization and donor funding, which has created a policy structure in which certain funded activities are conditional on the inclusion of civil society organizations. Many of Tanzania's development donors have been actively engaged in building the capacity of civil society in line with the broader governance agenda. Originally outlined by the World Bank (1989) but now broadly subscribed to by other western donors, the governance (or 'good governance') agenda assumes that development is achieved by the effective interaction of state, market and civil society, wherein civil society, represented by formal organisations and pressure groups, represents the interests of the poor, contributes to service delivery and development activities, and holds government to account (Abrahamsen, 2001). Since Tanzania's existing people's organisations, consisting of women's groups, farmer organisations and religious congregations (Jennings, 2008) and weakened after twenty years of socialist single party rule, did not match this model new and recognizable institutions, in the form of formal NGOs, were thought to be required.

In the mid-1990s much was made of the apparent 'withdrawal of the state' (Kiondo, 1995) from service provision in Tanzania, as anti-state rhetoric seemed to consolidate

---

encourage women to form income-generating groups, also run by the same sub-contracted CSO.

among development donors in favour of civil society actors. The government's on-going decentralization policies through the Local Government Reform Programme have shifted service delivery back to public providers. According to this policy discourse (see e.g. URT, 2007), support for civil society organizations is not intended to facilitate service delivery or small scale projects but to enable them to render public provision more effective through policy engagement, advocacy and ensuring accountability (Harrison, 2008). To this end, the formulation of the country's new NGO policy in 2002, conceived within the paradigm of a specific role for civil society in national development, was designed to foster the promotion of a national network of civil society organizations within a vertical structure with district, regional and national apex organizations. The poverty reduction strategy gave increasing place to civil society organizations as policy brokers with an accountability function, at the same time as donor spending brought these organizations into being or helped them to consolidate themselves.

The civil society sector in Tanzania has been aggressively promoted through international spending and targeted programming since the late 1990s. Key donors supporting this process, including the World Bank and DFID, fostered the evolution of disparate organizations into a visible sector that would need a policy to regulate its operations and a funding stream that could ensure that it engaged in the anticipated way with state and non-state actors. These policy directions were encouraged and endorsed by the international NGOs that had proliferated in Tanzania since liberalization (Mercer, 1999). Oxfam in particular was central to the

promotion of 'local' CSOs through finance, training and support, as were Action Aid, HIVOS and the US organisation PACT, which specialises in civil society capacity building. The drive to secure the political space occupied by self-defined civil society led to the establishment of the donor-funded NGO Policy Forum in 2003. The global development templates that informed these aspirations were promoted through a massive increase in international donor financing during this period.[2]

These donor-driven processes are extremely significant for determining what is now recognized in Tanzania as the civil society sector and indeed what constitutes 'development' as a designated sphere of activity. The result is a civil society sector operating in a range of activities categorized as developmental because they fit within current policy frameworks, but which may have only tangential impacts on human development outcomes. Very few Tanzanian civil society organizations are membership-based or self-financing. The majority are wholly dependent on donor funding (Shivji 2004). The supply-driven dimension of the entire civil society sector in Tanzania, as in other countries, has implications for the kinds of activities that these organizations undertake, their values and their organization (Heydemann & Hammack 2009). Key to the proliferation of the sector was the establishment of the Foundation for Civil Society as a mechanism through which nationally dispersed organizations operating across districts could apply for project funding. The FCS

[2] According to data for 2007 from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, external aid accounted for 40 per cent of the national budget and 80 per cent of the development budget (http://www.mof.go.tz/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=185).

grew out of a previous donor-funded initiative (initially designed by DFID), which had the explicit aim of growing the local civil society sector with a view to its engagement in policy and advocacy work nationally and in Dar es Salaam. Alongside international donor NGOs, which are also reliant on international donor and government funding, and which act in turn as donors to local organizations, it is responsible for the expansion of a number of enterprises that specialize in capacity building for the civil society sector.

In particular the availability of small grants, of which the smallest is approximately £2,500, has huge potential for impoverished CSOs to professionalize their activities and, for many, to begin activities. In a context where designated funding opportunities for small rural CSOs are slim, FCS funding is extremely attractive, along with the capacity building support it offers to potential applicants through workshops in regions and districts. Between 2003 and 2008, the FCS supported 1,305 projects nationally across four focus areas: safety nets (30 per cent), governance (27 per cent), policy (23 per cent) and advocacy (20 per cent) (FCS, 2008). A consequence of this is a template approach to the development of civil society organizations promoted through standardized capacity tools and organizational grids. The result is a huge number of nationally registered organizations (some 2500 in 2000 URT, 2000), an unknown number of nascent organizations that are yet to be registered and an ambiguous often unpopulated void between their stated missions outlined in the constitutions they are required to have as a condition for registration and their activities (Dill, 2009).

The tendency for organizations to base their activities on funding rather than mission is not new in Tanzania, but it is accentuated by current policies and funding priorities, leading to a civil society sector at district level that consists of a small number of structurally similar registered organizations that define themselves as either NGOs (working beyond the district) or CBOS (working within it) competing with others for funding opportunities across a number of sectors. District NGOs tend not to be membership based, but consist of a small number of core individuals who derive salaries and expenses from funded projects but who otherwise view themselves as 'volunteers'. Successful organizations have generally been formed as the projects of other, external organisations, such as international NGOs, through which their volunteers have learned how to bid for and manage funds and developed operational expertise.

District civil society is organized through umbrella networks that perform a gate-keeping function and liaise with Local Government Authorities through forums introduced as part of the Local Government Reform Programme. Formal sector faith organizations such as Christian churches may or may not choose to be part of these umbrella organisations, but they are often influential in the establishment of smaller non-faith-based CSOs that are active in the districts and become umbrella network members. Smaller Pentecostal churches and congregations are likely to remain outside this formally recognized civil society sector, as are Muslim organizations with the exception of BAKWATA, the state-sponsored national Islamic organization

associated with the Sufi *Qaddiriyya* order. BAKWATA-affiliated mosques and other conservative Islamic groups are now seeking a credible role in national development through involvement in the kinds of activities and services that convey developmental legitimacy such as operating dispensaries and HIV testing. A notable change in the aftermath of political liberalisation is the emergence of newer Islamic organizations that draw their doctrinal inspiration from Wahhabism. Such reformist organizations are both radical and conservative, and do not map neatly on to new ways of doing development.

The density of the civil society sector in rural districts has intensified with the increased availability of funding for specialized development activities around HIV and AIDS, associated in particular with the FCS, the Global Fund and PEPFAR. Because of the association of CSOs in policy discourse with communities an increased amount of HIV/AIDS funding has been specifically directed at CSOs for community interventions in support of vulnerable children and community sensitization around risk, infection and testing (Seckinelgin, 2007). The categorisation of HIV/AIDS as a 'cross-cutting' issue means that activities that support it are not confined to specialist sectoral organizations. This has created opportunities for a range of civil society organizations to access the AIDS funding stream, even if they are working in other sectors. This approach is not confined to Tanzania, but is part of a broader development agenda of civil society inclusion and devolution to community organizations and beneficiaries. In Tanzania, the money for HIV/AIDS is disbursed to CSOs via the national AIDS commission TACAIDS,

which is responsible for co-ordinating the Tanzanian Government's response to the AIDS epidemic.

The category of 'Most Vulnerable Children' (MVC) has also emerged as an important target group for development funding that can be spent via CSOs in Tanzania. MVCs are children affected by HIV/AIDS and severe poverty in their families (perhaps as a result of the death of a parent, because they are caregivers, or because they are themselves infected). At present, most MVC programmes are delivered by a group of international NGOs, the largest of which is PACT, an American non-profit corporation contracted to implement programmes funded by USAID. PACT in turn contracts district-based CSOs to deliver support to those children identified as MVC. A key component of support to children affected by HIV and AIDS is that it should be delivered in and through community structures as outlined in UNICEF's Framework for the Care and Support of Children Affected by HIV and AIDS. MVC programming in Tanzania, as indeed globally, is then premised on the existence of what types of organisations are recognized as appropriate community level institutions. This, combined with the current policy prioritization of what are taken to be legitimate forms of civil society ensures that these new local organizations have a role in the implementation of MVC programmes.

The outcome has been the extension of opportunities for the expansion of local formal civil society organizations and, in particular, for increased differentiation

between those which access funding and hence become development actors and those which are unfunded and do not undertake any activities. It is not uncommon for organizations originally established to work on completely different issues, such as tree planting and conservation, to become engaged in HIV/AIDS education.

The 'civil society sector' in rural Tanzania

In practice, what has emerged at district level in Tanzania is a relatively new and distinct 'civil society sector' made up of CSOs and FBOs, which have been enrolled as development contractors in ways different from the recent past when NGOs were cast as alternative providers of services such as health and education (Jennings 2008, Kiondo, 1995). In the two districts studied, very few CSOs are now involved in activities to support community development or sustainable livelihoods, activities that had been fashionable areas of donor support prior to the new wave of civil society expansion. District CSOs remain dependent on donor support, often from international NGOs. FBOs – at least the more established institutions – have maintained their service delivery roles (around health and education), and in some instances have extended activities into new fields of provision based on new financial models as with private secondary schools and nursery schools. Moreover, these organisations are aiming to engage in the new civil society sector through the formation of off-shoot CSOs, generally as the evolution of church initiated community development projects.

The evidence from Magu and Newala districts is that all kinds of CSO, whether faith-based or not, are strategizing to fit their activities into current donor priorities of HIV/AIDS awareness and prevention and support for MVCs. At present this entails seminars on good governance, community-based interventions around HIV/AIDS, including some support to People Living With HIV/AIDS (e.g. one-off food parcels), and intermittent support to a small number of children identified as vulnerable to attend school (e.g. provision of uniform, school materials, some food). These projects are money- and time-bound, which means that any support available comes to an end with each discrete project.

The CSO sector in both districts has proliferated in response to the rolling out of funding opportunities nation-wide. The district umbrella organization in Magu (MACSONET) had 56 members in 2009, including both secular and faith-based organisations, although the distinction between them is not straightforward. MACSONET refers to all of its members as CSOs, and includes small CBOs, branches of large international NGOs, NGOs formed by the local MP, NGOs operating as cooperative businesses, progressive farmers' groups, and a district youth umbrella organization established by UNICEF.

FBO members include equally diverse organisations such as individual projects established by religious organizations, independent CBOs, and the local branch of BAKWATA. The Roman Catholic Church, KKKT (Evangelical Lutheran Church Tanzania) and the Seventh Day Adventists were all MACSONET members but their

membership had generated some confusion over their categorization since they did not have specific development 'projects' which could be counted as active umbrella members. In Newala, membership of the district CSO umbrella had doubled from 11 in 2003 to 22 members 2009, and included an equally diverse group of organizations as in Magu, although none of the umbrella members could be described as FBOs. Nevertheless religious institutions were active in Newala, including BAKWATA and a large number of mosques, the Anglican Church, the Roman Catholic Church (which had established an FBO dealing with HIV), KKKT, and the Free Pentecostal Church of Tanzania.

The civil society sectors in Magu and Newala were remarkably similar. The majority of CSOs were small and personalized, revolving around a founding person or small group of people. CSO work, when it needed to be done, was carried out by such founding members, who often described themselves as volunteers. Most had full-time jobs or businesses to run, apart from their involvement with the CSO. The term 'CSO' usually denoted that the organization had complied with the legal requirements for NGO status in Tanzania: they had a constitution, aims and objectives, were registered at the national or district level, had a bank account, and had premises. Some had built or rented offices, emblazoned with the CSO name or logo, while others operated out of a leader's private business premises.

The CSO sector in both districts was characterized by uniformity in the development aims and activities of CSOs, including the religious institutions. This was evident

from the similarities in stated aims and objectives listed in CSOs' constitutions (alleviating poverty through good governance, empowering women, providing services to most vulnerable children, and fighting HIV/AIDS). More significant, were the similarities in activities that CSOs had recently completed or for which they were writing funding proposals. During the period of research the most common activities among all CSOs in terms of money spent and for which further funding was being sought revolved around HIV/AIDS and MVCs, in direct response to the emergence of these two donor funding streams in Tanzania over the last five years.

There was very little difference between self-proclaimed faith-based Islamic and Christian and secular CSOs with respect to the types of activities for which they were applying for funding. Current policies and funding streams for AIDS and support for MVCs dominate the civil society sector. Religious institutions used existing structures as vehicles for spending such donor money (e.g. the Catholic Church of St Bernadetha Parish in Magu obtained funding to run a series of local community-based HIV seminars), others established discrete 'projects' under the umbrella of the church (e.g. the AIC kindergarten project in Magu funded by the international FBO Compassion International), while other faith institutions set up their own CSOs to capture HIV/AIDS funding (e.g. BAKWATA).

Islamic institutions, particularly individual mosques, have been more distanced from the formal CSO sector than have Christian organizations and individual churches, although there are signs that this is beginning to change. BAKWATA for

instance is relatively close to the national CSO sector, as demonstrated through its access to the funding available for CSOs. New, young Islamic FBOs are emerging in Newala. One newly-registered Islamic CSO was self-consciously modelling itself on the formal CSO sector to which it sought connection through participation in workshops and district and regional networks. Another ran a *madrasa* and was connected to a large Sunni mosque in town, and was plugged in to a national Ansuari movement with transnational linkages through the *madrasa* teacher, who had moved to Newala after his training in Dar es Salaam, where he had been taught by scholars from Saudi Arabia, Iran and Egypt.

Across both districts, all recipients of HIV/AIDS funds had delivered a short series of workshops, seminars and 'sensitization' meetings in a few villages or to target groups (lower local government officials, teachers, school children). The amounts of money received were small, and activities were oriented towards telling people how to prevent the spread of HIV, mostly through the government's ABC message,[3] although the religious institutions did not advocate the use of condoms. Indeed, these donor-funded activities blurred the boundaries between CSOs, FBOs and the local state, as individual Local Government staff were frequently sub-contracted by both CSOs and FBOs to deliver expert knowledge on HIV to rural communities.

Within the context of specific development interventions, it is difficult to separate out a 'religious' sector populated by discrete institutions. Rather, the availability of

[3] *Acha kabisa, Badilisha tabia, tumia Condom* (abstinence, change habits, use a condom).

donor funds for designated civil society activities dissolves the assumed boundaries between faith and non-faith actors as long as certain organisational forms enable inclusion within the civil society category. Where institutions are not reliant on these funding streams there is more scope for autonomous activity, as with the Methodist Church in Magu (to which we return below). This is not to say that religion did not have a role to play in district civil society. Indeed, individuals based in a range of institutions were using faith-based strategies – beliefs, methods or institutions – in new and innovative ways. Given the long established relationship between certain Christian churches and aspirational elites in Tanzania, as in other post colonial settings, it is not surprising that both new forms of Christian organisation and civil society forms provide similar vehicles for leadership and transformation sometimes, often within the same institutional package.

Beyond the mainstream churches once associated with formal avenues to educational opportunities and newly popular evangelical churches are claiming the language of development as an aspect of evangelical mission and means of personal salvation (cf Bornstein, 2005). Ironically, some of the more vocal churches that claim development activities as a means of evangelization are very often those that attract the kinds of congregation at the margins of inclusion in development endeavours, those preoccupied with matters of the spirit, witchcraft and healing (cf Christiansen 2010). These are likely to be small-scale Pentecostal churches, run under the authority of an inspired pastor and are largely autonomous from structures of ecclesiastical authority.

Some such churches establish small-scale projects to support church members, particularly projects that can be situated within evangelical discourses. A case in point is the Church of Nazarene, a recently established church with a congregation of around forty people several kilometres from the main road that runs through Magu District. The pastor proudly showed us the borehole it was operating, itself a project financed through connections with a congregation in the United States. The borehole was a priority for this small church, not only because of the water it made available to local communities, in particular women, but because it provides tangible testament to Christ's power, described in John 4.13 , as the 'water of life'. In addition to the borehole, the church is embarking on a project to provide training in small businesses to local people. Although at the time of research it had not yet obtained funding for this venture, it had begun to build a shelter for holding the workshops and training courses which have become part of the established institutional architecture for development activities even in rural parts of Tanzania (Green, 2003).

This church is interesting for other reasons concerning the blurring of boundaries between domains of influence and power, a phenomenon noted in accounts of politics in Africa, which identify 'straddling' across positions of influence as a strategy for consolidating political power (Bayart, 1994). Whereas in the past such straddling entailed seeking influence through holding a position of formal governmental authority on the one hand and using 'traditional' channels on the

other, contemporary strategies seek to simultaneously develop positions in religious organizations, local government and the civil society sector.

Most senior local government staff members in Magu District, were involved in or trying to become involved in local civil society organizations. Members of the local elite were also influential in religious congregations. The Nazarene Church, was founded by a local former political 'big man' who had diversified his activities after being deselected as the CCM[4] candidate for ward councillor after twenty years in the post. After meeting a pastor from the Church of Nazarene at a training workshop, he had 'found God again', and had built a small church on some of his land, along with the borehole, a much needed resource in this location.

The role of faith in the approaches adopted by religious organizations

In Magu and Newala, although only some of the organizations in the districts are categorised officially as FBOs, faith was important to nearly all the organizations in different ways, from the institutional to the personal. Many founders of small, recently established CSOs considered their personal faith to be central to their desire to foster development, even if their organization was not registered as an FBO. Some organizations that started out as FBOs, for example the Anglican Youth Care

[4] *Chama Cha Mapinduzi*, the political party that has been in power in Tanzania both during the one-party era and, since 1995, the multi-party era.

Programme, operated as secular CSOs, in this instance training young men in carpentry and running as a cooperative.

Faith in the sense of an individual's belief in God informed the practice of the members of this organization insofar as it legitimated collaboration across the religious divide, but it did not determine the activities of the organization. Similarly, Christian belief in the Garden of Eden story was used by members of an environmental CSO, Magu Food Security, currently working on HIV and AIDS, to justify their self identification as a FBO, even though they are now engaged in wholly secular activities. The chairman explained that because God made the world and all that is in it, looking after the environment is a Christian duty and an act of faith.

Despite these examples, the salience of religious narratives, identity and practice to development outcomes should not be overstated. Faith is fundamental to social practice in Tanzania and religious affiliation is an important dimension of personal identity. Faith in terms of what people believe and the impact of their value systems on practice are important components of Christian discourse, particularly emphasised in the Protestant and evangelical churches which prioritise the responsibility of the agentive individual to bring about change in themselves which can lead to wider changes. This is the stance of the Seventh Day Adventists church in Magu which does not pursue development projects as such but whose entire

theological project is premised on enabling individuals to better themselves spiritually, educationally and economically.

A relationship between faith and agency may inform action for certain individuals but it does not necessarily contribute to effective organizations. While our informants in Magu reported that they regard development as a project of improvement for the nation as a whole and perhaps also of benefit to the less fortunate, there is nothing to suggest that faith or religious affiliation makes the activities of religious organizations distinct or contributes to their effectiveness. There were ineffective organisations, organisational shells formed in the expectation of getting funds but without the capabilities to undertake any kind of work, in both the secular and faith category of civil society organisation.

Both faith and non-faith organizations depend on external funding and, with the exception of larger Christian organizations that are part of wider structures, do not set their own development agendas. Where efficient organizations have managed to work out ways of undertaking development activities that reflect their theological aspirations, as in the case of the Methodist Church in Magu, their success was related less to the beliefs on which the action was based than on the competence and pragmatism of the organization.

The Methodist Church in Magu was a missionary church from Kenya that had been in the town since 2006. The church was building up a congregation slowly. The

pastor and his core staff were Kenyan. This church uses faith as a starting point to legitimate practical engagement in the world, believing that needs of the body have to be addressed as the basis on which to engage with those of a spiritual nature. This philosophy informs the approach of the church to community service responds to local demand for services in health and education, as well as income generation through vocational training. The majority of users of the services provided by the church are affiliated to other churches.

Both development activities and service delivery are regarded as a Christian duty, but this does not mean that they are provided free of charge. The aim underlying the service delivery activities is to recover costs and ensure sustainability. The Methodist Church reported that it builds on its long history internationally and in East Africa to replicate successful models of service delivery. It uses its networks to secure funding from within the Methodist community, enabling it to embark on its own initiatives in areas, such as health or education, where it has consolidated expertise. The Methodist Church could take a long term, consistent and strategic approach to its engagement in development, in this case through its focus on services, because it does not depend on the whims of development funding.

The relative importance of body and spirit was not confined to Methodists but was referred to by all the churches when explaining their position with respect to development and service delivery. In general, mainstream churches such as the Roman Catholics and Anglicans reiterated the prioritization of the body that the

Methodist pastor outlined, as did some of the more mainstream Assemblies of God congregations. These organizations were keen to promote activities that would improve the living conditions of their congregations (and others) while at the same time enabling beneficiaries to become more spiritually engaged.

Smaller Pentecostal churches, including some of the Assemblies of God congregations that were more focused on spiritual wellbeing, were less likely than the mainstream denominations to engage in formal development activities. This was either because they prioritize the development of the individual's spiritual resistance, as in the particular Assemblies of God Church which viewed dealing with Evil as a necessary precondition for development, and hence focused on activities directed towards repentance and dealing with witchcraft, or because they prioritize the development of individuals as Christian persons.

As we have seen, the Seventh Day Adventist church in Magu encourages its members to work hard and be responsible, to become fluent in English and to inform themselves of world affairs, as a basis for engagement in it which will be personally developmental. Arguably, the kinds of activities that these churches promoted were intended to be enabling of individuals' strategies for achieving their own aspirations framed by cultural associations of the developmental. This is clearly evident in the kinds of literature promoted by the Seventh Day Adventists, internationally and available in Tanzania, with images of modern citizens in office dress, working in offices and living in the archetypical urban cityscapes of world

cities. Certainly, where these churches promote a perspective of individual agency empowered through belief rather than subject to external forces, they are seen by adherents as offering a means of acting effectively in the world, a mode of engaging as an agent with what Hart (2001) has termed 'small d' development as immanent process rather than the 'big D' Development of the formal development institutions.

Conclusions and some implications for development policy

The findings from this research have implications for the current models through which development is imagined and implemented in Tanzania and elsewhere. It shows clearly how the forms of civil society that emerge as development actors in countries which do not have a strong tradition of civil society organizations with forms amenable to development contracting, such as Tanzania, are determined largely by development priorities and funding streams. Further, the resultant civil society sector is consolidated through services and markets that come into being to support its expansion and to use up donor funds.

In Tanzania FBOs are not necessarily separate from the NGOs or CSOs regarded as secular: they are simply part of a civil society sector which is imagined to be 'closer to the poor' and therefore better at implementing 'development' activities. This has meant that FBOs and CSOs have been enrolled as contractors providing public education campaigns and support for vulnerable children, activities that themselves have been recast as 'development', in accordance with current policy priorities.

Where faith organizations seek to become engaged with what is currently defined as development in Tanzania, they have to conform to certain organizational forms. Consequently, some faith organizations establish CSOs as projects that can then become autonomous CSOs, which maintain relationships with their faith origins but which aim to operate in very similar ways to CSOs that are not associated with any particular faith organization. It is likely that, as certain religious organizations become more policy savvy and seek to adapt the basis on which they engage with development in order to have more influence, their action strategies and organizational forms will increasingly resemble secular organizations. This is clearly evident in the current interest being shown in the policy-influencing agenda by church organizations in Dar es Salaam – perhaps again reflecting donor priorities around the value of consulting CSOs and citizens on policy and the place of faith (see Taylor, forthcoming). Such transformations seem less likely to occur at district level, where the scope for advocacy is limited and also because there is strong resistance to what would be perceived as religious favouritism in district politics in Tanzania.

The research shows that where development agendas are externally generated and civil society is driven by supply-side factors, religious organizations are not very different from other civil society organizations. Religious affiliation does not appear to contribute to particular closeness to the poor, organizational effectiveness or taking innovative positions on what development is. On the other hand faith, in

terms of the values of individual actors engaged in civil society organizations, religious or otherwise, does have an impact on their stated motivations. This impact in Tanzania is generally strongly moral and inclusive, legitimating approaches that include members of all faith groups and religious affiliations. This reflects the place of religion in Tanzanian popular culture more generally and conforms to the longstanding place accorded to religious ideology in Tanzania's discourse of national development. Whether or not faith adherence and religious values and beliefs lead to different kinds of development outcomes is open to question, partly because the majority of Tanzanians claim some kind of religious motivation and partly because, as a result, there are no institutional settings in which religious attitudes do not have some kind of influence.

Development policy based on an assumption of some kind of qualitative difference between FBOs and CSOs in Tanzania will simply incentivize the institutionalization of assumed difference, when what exists is similarity, and when poor policy instruments around community programming and civil society are largely responsible for development failure, not the attributes of civil society organizations. Donor evaluations and assessments over the long-term that do not simply focus on accounts and financial management are more likely to gain useful insights into the complex outcomes of such spending. More faith is certainly not the answer. Less faith, in the sense of less blind faith in positive development outcomes resulting from specific institutional forms and standard practices – such as sensitization, group formation, rotating credit and so on - would foster a more critical perspective

and help Tanzanian citizens and their organisations develop their own approaches to their priority issues.

References

Abrahamsen, R. (2001) *Disciplining Democracy: Development Discourse and Good Governance in Africa,* London: Zed.

Bakari, M.A. (2007) Religions, governance and development in Tanzania. In Mhina, A. (Ed) *Religions and Development in Tanzania: A Preliminary Literature Review*, Birmingham: Religions and Development WP 11, pp 17-30.

Bayart, F (1994) *The State in Africa: The Politics of the Belly*, London: Longman.

Becker, F. (2007) The virus and the scriptures: Muslims and AIDS in Tanzania. *Journal of Religion in Africa,* 37, pp 16-40.

Becker, F. (2008) *Becoming Muslim in Mainland Tanzania, 1890-2000*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Bornstein, E. (2005) *The Spirit of Development: Protestant NGOs, Morality, and Economics in Zimbabwe,* Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Clarke, G. (2007) Agents of transformation? Donors, faith-based organisations and international development, *Third World Quarterly*, 28, 1, 77-96.

Clarke, G. and M. Jennings (eds) (2007) *Development, civil society and faith-based organizations*, Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke

Deneulin, S & Bano, M (2009) *Religion in Development. Rewriting the Secular Script*, London, Zed.

Deneulin, S & Rakodi, C (2011) Revisiting Religion; Development Studies Thirty years On, *World Development* 39 (10, 45-54.

Dilger, H-G. (2007) Healing the wounds of modernity: salvation, community and care in a neo-Pentecostal church in Dar es Salaam. *Journal of Religion in Africa,* 37, pp 59-83.

Dill, B. (2009) The paradoxes of community-based participation in Dar es Salaam, *Development and Change*, 40(4), pp 717-743.

FCS (Foundation for Civil Society) (2008) *Annual Report 2008*, Dar es Salaam: FCS http://www.thefoundation.or.tz/images/annualreport2008.pdf

Green, M. (2003) Globalising development in Tanzania: Policy franchising through participatory project management. *Critique of Anthropology*, 23(2), pp 123-143.

Green, M. (2000) Participatory development and the appropriation of agency in southern Tanzania. *Critique of Anthropology*, 20(1), pp 67-86.

Green, M & Mesaki, S (2005) The Birth of the `Salon': Poverty, Modernization and Dealing with Witchraft in Southern Tanzania, *American Ethnologist*

Hart, G. (2001) Development critiques in the 1990s: cul de sacs and promising paths. *Progress in Human Geography*, 25, pp 649-658.

Hammack, D & Heydeman, S 2009 *Globalization, Philanthropy and Civil Society, Exporting Institutional Logics Abroad*, Bloomington, Indiana University Press.

Harrison, G. (2008) From the global to the local? Governance and development at the local level: reflections from Tanzania. *Journal of Modern African Studies*, 46(2), pp 169-189.

Hasu, P. (2006) World Bank and heavenly bank in poverty and prosperity: the case of Tanzanian faith gospel. *Review of African Political Economy*, 33(110), pp 679-692.

Hearn, J. (2001) Taking liberties. Contesting visions of the civil society project. *Critique of Anthropology*, 21(4), pp 339-360.

Jennings, M. (2008) *Surrogates of the state: NGOs, development and ujamaa in Tanzania*. Bloomfield, Kumarian Press.

Kiondo, A.S.Z. (1995) When the state withdraws: local development, politics and liberalisation in Tanzania. In Gibbon, P. (Ed) *Liberalised Development in Tanzania: Studies on Accumulation Processes and Local Institutions*, Uppsala: Nordic Africa Institute, pp109-176.

Mallya, E.T. (2010) Faith-based organizations, the state and politics in Tanzania. In Bompani, B. and Frahm-Arp, M. (Eds) *Development and Politics from Below: Exploring Religious Spaces in the African State.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp 131-51.

Mercer, C. (1999) Reconceptualising state-society relations in Tanzania: are NGOs 'making a difference'? *Area*, 31(3), pp 247-258.

Mercer, C. (2002) Deconstructing development: the discourse of *maendeleo* and the politics of women's participation on Mount Kilimanjaro. *Development and Change,* 33(1), pp 101-127.

Mercer, C. (2003) Performing partnership: civil society and the illusions of good governance in Tanzania. *Political Geography*, 22(7), pp 741-763.

Schatzberg, M. (2001) *Political Legitimacy in Middle Africa: Family, Father, Food*, Bloomington IND: Indiana University Press.

Shivji, I 2004 Tanzanian NGOs. What we are, what we are not and what we ought to be, Development in Practice,

Seckinelgin, H. (2007) *The International Politics of HIV/AIDS: Global Disease – Local Plain*, London: Routledge.

Swidler, A. and S. Watkins (2009) 'Teach a man to fish': the sustainability doctrine and its social consequences. *World Development,* 37(7), pp 1182-1196.

Taylor, M. (forthcoming) *Strengthening the Voice of the Poor? Faith-based Organizations and Policy Consultation Processes in Nigeria and Tanzania*, Birmingham: Religions and Development WP.

URT (United Republic of Tanzania) (2000) *Directory of Tanzania Non-Governmental Organizations*, Dar es Salaam: Office of the Vice President.

URT (United Republic of Tanzania) (2007) *Joint Government-Development Partner Programme Evaluation*, Dar es Salaam: Prime Minister's Office Regional Administration and Local Government, Local Government Reform Programme.

White, S 2009 beyond the Paradox. Religion, Family and Modernity in Contemporary Bangladesh, Birmingham, Religions and Development Programme, Working Paper 32

World Bank (1989) *Sub-Saharan Africa, From Crisis to Sustainable Growth: A Long Term Perspective Study*, Washington D.C.: World Bank.